Reviewer’s report

Title: Survival over seven years with peritoneal mesothelioma

Version: 1 Date: 19 June 2010

Reviewer: Hiroshi Hirano

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Findings that shed new light on the possible pathogenesis of a disease or an adverse effect

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: No

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Dear sir:

I recommend the editor-in-chief to reject this paper for publication, based on the following criticisms.

Sincerely yours,

Hiroshi Hirano, MD, PhD

This paper presents a case of peritoneal malignant mesothelioma surviving for more than 7 years. The authors relate the long survival time to the expression of ERbeta. However, cases of peritoneal malignant mesothelioma with long time survival are not rare. Furthermore, there are several serious problems described below in this paper.
1) The authors present no histological figures (H&E, immunohistochemical stain).
2) The author should present the evidence that this tumor is not well differentiated papillary mesothelioma, cystic mesothelioma or serous adenocarcinoma.
3) To confirm that this tumor is malignant mesothelioma, immunohistochemical staining of additional markers of malignant mesothelioma is required.
4) Fig. 1:
Does Fig. 1A show the breast tissue? I guess that this is a lymph node. Why do you use the breast tissue as a negative control?
ERs are present in the nucleus. However, the staining of ER is found in the cytoplasm but not in the nucleus. Therefore, this immunohistochemical results indicate that staining of ER is not specific.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests