Reviewer’s report

Title: Right pulmonary artery agenesis presenting with uncontrolled asthma in an adult: a case report Hafez Hayek1*, Jaime Palomino1, and Supat Thammasitboon1 Address: 1Section of Pulmonary Diseases, Critical Care and Environmental Medicine. Tulane University Health Sciences Center, 1430 Tulane Ave, SL-9, New Orleans, LA 70123, USA Email addresses HH: hafezhayek@hotmail.com JP: jpalomin@tulane.edu ST: sthammas@tulane.edu *Corresponding author

Version: 3 Date: 20 March 2011

Reviewer: ARGYRIS TZOUVELEKIS

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected association between diseases or symptoms

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: No

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is a report of an already known association between right pulmonary agenesis and recurrent bronchopulmonary infections. I am not convinced on the asthma history of the patient (based on the spirometry results the patient seems more likely to suffer from restrictive pattern rather than obstructive with a mild decrease in the diffusing capacity) and the mechanism that correlates UAPA with uncontrolled asthma. How did authors define uncontrolled asthma and how was control of asthma symptoms connected with clinical improvement? Antibiotics
administration was associated with clinical improvement since they may facilitated eradication of a specific pathogen that was responsible for recurrent pulmonary infections. Did the patients also suffer from bronchiectases? That would definitely explain recurrent pulmonary infections

Quality of written English: Acceptable