Reviewer's report

Title: Right pulmonary artery agenesis presenting with uncontrolled asthma in an adult: a case report Hafez Hayek1*, Jaime Palomino1, and Supat Thammasitboon1 Address: 1Section of Pulmonary Diseases, Critical Care and Environmental Medicine. Tulane University Health Sciences Center, 1430 Tulane Ave, SL-9, New Orleans, LA 70123, USA Email addresses HH: hafezhayek@hotmail.com JP: jpalomin@tulane.edu ST: sthammas@tulane.edu *Corresponding author

Version: 3 Date: 14 March 2011

Reviewer: Georgios Kouliatsis

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Although congenital unilateral absence of the pulmonary artery is a disease entity that is not unheard of, in my opinion it is still worth reporting, especially in this setting that the patient is an adult with a history of probably several medical consultations. The authors have done a nice jobe with the presentation, although a chest X-ray is, in my opinion, a necessary supplement to the manuscript and so would any previous chest X-rays. The authors might want to emphasize and comment on the rather delayed diagnosis, given that a patient with uncontrolled
asthma and frequent exacerbations has probably seeked medical advice several times.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests