Reviewer's report

Title: Humerus metastasis from a sacrococcygeal chordoma. Case report

Version: 1 Date: 1 February 2010

Reviewer: T Yamaguchi

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The manuscript described a case report of chordoma metastatic to humeral shaft, associated with a pathologic fracture. As the authors mention it is an extremely rare event.

It requires some important revision.

P2L13-4 and P3L1-2. Chordoma does not develop in the intervertebral disc. This fact does not support the hypothesis that chordoma arise from notochordal remnant/rest. Nowadays, chordoma is known to arise from benign notochordal cell tumor that is an intraosseous benign precursor of notochordal cell origin. Therefore, the sentences should be changed properly.

P2L5-6. Is “metastatic spread from chordoma is not an uncommon occurrence” true?

P2L12. Is “Histological and immunohistochemical studies were infavor of
metastatic chordoma” right?

P2L15. “epitheloid” should be changed to “epithelioid”.

P2L15-16. Carbon ion therapy becomes a best therapeutic modality for local control of chordoma.

P3L2-4. The reference is old and is not proper. The date cited is discrepant from the description in P5L6-7.

Case Report.

1. Clinical, imaging, and histological information of primary tumor (chordoma) is not well described.

2. The differential diagnosis does not seem enough. It should include mixed tumor. It is very important to distinguish metastatic chordoma from mixed tumor of bone.

3. No information concerning other metastatic lesions such as lungs, livers, spine, and ribs is described.

P4L2. State the location of complaint! Upper arm?

P4L7. “he” must be changed to “she”.

Figure legends are not enough.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.