Reviewer's report

Title: An unusual cause of chyluria- post radiofrequency ablation (RFA) of a renal cell carcinoma: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 21 October 2010

Reviewer: ferekh salim

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Could the proximity of the lesion to the collecting system be of relevance to the discussion? If so, it might be useful to know a little more detail regarding the location of the tumour within the kidney (ie. was it intra-cortical or exophytic). This could be supplemented by a pre-treatment CT image.

A minor point is that the second paragraph on page 5 seems to have an incomplete description of the device used for the procedure "Leveen RFA probe with a 3cm diameter ..."?

Overall this is an interesting and informative report highlighting a rare complication of this procedure.
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests