Reviewer's report

Title: Boiled egg in peritoneal cavity - a giant peritoneal loose body: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 29 October 2009

Reviewer: Imtiaz Wani

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Sir, I have read your nice and rare case report and it is very learning one .I have following suggestions for you.

A)Abstarct: 1)Your sentences "Peritoneal loose bodies or peritoneal mice are asymptomatic and mostly found as incidentallomas during abdominal surgery or autopsy" is just copy paste of first line of abstract "Journal of clinical gastroenterology 2006;40(5):427-30" please write it little different 2)Word incidentollamas should be replaced as an incidental finding ,incidentoloma is term used for specific tumour . 3)Case presentation in abstract should be rewritten to focus on case and conclusion can be shortened 4) & should be written as "and"???
B) Your introduction, discussion and conclusion are overlapping.

C) Introduction: Line 3: have been fully demonstrated can be written as have been reported in literature Line 8: It is become not becomes Line 9: It is tomography not topography

D) Case report: 1) In place of pain abdomen better word would be abdominal pain 2) General physical examination, abdominal examination as well as systemic examination is missing which form important pillar in a case history 3) Please list important laboratory parameters in this patient 4) by surprise we found a boiled hen's egg as if had been polished. what does this convey, please mention in terms of consistency, color, shape and you can then write resembles boiled hen's egg 5) In place of Macroscopically, word grossly can be used 6) Line 13: The white part is, it will be was not is 7) What was postoperative period and follow up in patient

E) Discussion Complications from loose bodies as intestinal obstruction, hepatic pseudolipoma or retention of urine etc. can be discussed if author wishes, rather references for these complications are cited in text You should include differential diagnosis of such loose bodies References: Reference 3: You have not written last author which is Koichi Hirata