Reviewer’s report

**Title:** Sarcoid reaction associated with Merkel cell carcinoma revealed by fluorodeoxyglucose positron emission tomography: a case report

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 17 December 2010

**Reviewer:** Joanna Domagala-Kulawik

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

**Comments to authors:**

This is very interesting report. Sarcoid reaction may coexist with malignancy. This case presents unique clinical situation and is worth publication. The description in this form is very limited and “laconic”. I don’t know what is the number of words but it seems that less than 2000 required by Editor.

**General comments:**

1. Introduction- very short. The JMCR is addressed to different specialists and is necessary to explain: what is sarcoidosis, what is Merkel disease with special account to the differential diagnosis and to precisely describe this “epithelioid granuloma”.

2. Case presentation-
a. We know nothing about the signs and symptoms from respiratory tract, nothing about anamnesis- sarcoidosis is chronic disease, nothing about smoking status
b. Phrase 2- what kind of biopsy was taken: core? Fine needle?
c. Merkel cell ca belongs to cancers of small cell and it is essential to distinguish this tumor from small cell lung cancer, the more that mediastinal adenopathy was found.
d. Author should precisely describe which group of nodes was involved and what was these nodes size.
e. In some centres the FDG-PET is described quantitatively- is it possible in the Author's center?
f. I'm still not sure if this adenopathy was related only with granulomatous tissue. There is the possibility that it was sarcoid reaction around cancer- this point needs explanation. What was follow up of this patient? Is she alive? healthy, without or with relapse?

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'