Reveiwer's report

Title: Beta hCG Secreting Non-Small Cell Lung Cancer: A relation spelling doom? A Case Report

Saakshi Khattri MD1, Abhirami Vivekanandarajah MD2, Seema Varma MD3, Frank Kong MD4 1,2 Department of Internal Medicine, 3Department of Hematology Oncology, 4Department of Pathology, Staten Island University Hospital, New York 10305 CORRESPONDING AUTHOR Saakshi Khattri 475 Seaview Avenue Staten Island University Hospital Staten Island, NY 10305 Email- saakshi_doc@hotmail.com COAUTHORS Abhirami Vivekanandarajah Email- avivek27@gmail.com Seema Varma Email- seema_varma@siuh.edu Frank Kong Email- frank_kong@siuh.edu

Version: 2 Date: 23 August 2010

Reviewer: Hiroshi Hirano

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Comments to authors.

Major comments

This case report presents a case of non-small cell carcinoma of the lung at Stage IV which produced beta hCG. However, Yoshimura et al. have already reported
that almost half of 99 patients with non-small cell lung cancers showed positive values of urine beta hCG, and that 12 patients with non-small cell lung cancers (8 adenocarcinomas, 2 squamous cell carcinoma and 2 large cell carcinomas) showed elevated serum levels of beta hCG. (Cancer, 73: 2745-2752). They concluded that ectopic production of beta hCG by lung cancer is not rare and urinary beta hCG might be a potential marker of lung cancer. Thus, non-small cell carcinoma producing beta hCG is not rare.

Minor comments.

1) There are several careless mistakes in sentences.
2) Clarify histological diagnosis of the cancer. It looks like squamous cell carcinoma rather than large cell carcinoma.
3) A figure of negative staining for CK-20 is not necessary.
4) Beta hCG-positive cells are rare in spite of a high level of serum beta hCG. Explain the reason.
5) Figures of p63 and CK7 could be reduced.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest.