Reviewer's report

Title: Beta hCG Secreting Non-Small Cell Lung Cancer: A relation spelling doom? A Case Report Saakshi Khattri MD1, Abhirami Vivekanandarajah MD2, Seema Varma MD3, Frank Kong MD4 1,2 Department of Internal Medicine, 3Department of Hematology Oncology, 4Department of Pathology, Staten Island University Hospital, New York 10305 CORRESPONDING AUTHOR Saakshi Khattri 475 Seaview Avenue Staten Island University Hospital Staten Island, NY 10305 Email- saakshi_doc@hotmail.com COAUTHORS Abhirami Vivekanandarajah Email- avivek27@gmail.com Seema Varma Email- seema_varma@siuh.edu Frank Kong Email- frank_kong@siuh.edu

Version: 2 Date: 22 August 2010

Reviewer: Ray Kruse Iles

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Such hCG beta expression is associated with aggressive lung tumours so this is an important case report. However, I feel this report needs further emphasis regarding the occurrence which is not insignificant.

There are at least 5 more comprehensive studies in the literature establishing
that a significant minority of Lung cancers express hCGbeta. A rudimentary meta analysis showed that elevated serum hCGbeta was detected by some 17% (32/177) and Immunohistochemical positivity found in about 30% (74/233) of Lung cancers.

See


Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests