Author's response to reviews

Title: Solid variant of aneurysmal bone cyst of the heel; a case report

Authors:

Joanna Lekka (Jlekka@yahoo.gr)
Theofani Gavressea (fangav@261.gr)
Gabriella Stanc-Giannakopoulos (gabidr1999@yahoo.com)
Nikolaos Demertzis (NDemertzis@yahoo.gr)

Version: 7 Date: 23 October 2010

Author's response to reviews:

Author's response to reviews
Solid variant of aneurysmal bone cyst of the heel: a case report

J. Lekka (Jlekka@yahoo.gr)
Th. Gavressea (fangav@yahoo.gr)
G. Stanc-Giannakopoulos (gabidr1999@yahoo.com)
N. Demertzis (NDemertzis@yahoo.gr)

Author response to review: see over

Restructured abstract:

Reviewer's report

Title: Solid variant of aneurysmal bone cyst of the heel; a case report

Version: 2 Date: 26 April 2010
Reviewer: Bora Gurel

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors present a short, concise case report of a rare variant of aneurysmal bone cyst, presenting in a somewhat atypical location. My comments are as follows:

1. It may be necessary to expand the discussion a bit further, describing in a few sentences, the major histopathological findings the authors have used to distinguish the solid variant of ABC from giant cell tumour of bone. In a similar note, in what way is the pattern of reactive bone production is different from the type of bone that one expects to see in low-grade and high-grade osteosarcoma?

Giant cell tumor has a uniform distribution of the giant cells and diffuse arrangement of round to oval stromal cells. In ABCs the giant cells are usually scattered or in small clusters, while only in rare instances may be abundant. The stromal cells are spindle shaped, without histologic evidence of sarcomatous transformation.

Low-grade osteosarcoma is much less cellular and less active mitotically, while high-grade osteosarcoma obviously shows marked pleomorphism. The pattern of reactive bone production is different from the type of bone, that one expects to see in low-grade and high-grade osteosarcoma [1, 4]. In ABCs the reactive bonny trabeculae are lined by plump, benign-appearing osteoblasts, which is not a feature of osteosarcomas.

2. The last word of the conclusion section, "diagnose", should be changed to "diagnosis".
Change made as indicated from the reviewer.

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.

Reviewer’s report
Title: Solid variant of aneurysmal bone cyst of the heel; a case report
Version: 2 Date: 27 June 2010
Reviewer: Kerem Basarir

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease
Has the case been reported coherently?: No
Is the case report authentic?: Yes
Is the case report ethical?: Yes
Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No
Is this case worth reporting?: No
Is the case report persuasive?: No
Does the case report have explanatory value?: No
Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No
Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No
Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:
This is an excellent description of a condition with a new location. As an essay on the subject, this case is instructive and comprehensive. For those who do not see the condition with any frequency, this paper is a reminder of the features which differ from other tumours. However I fear that to those of readers who practice in this area, this is no more than a good essay repeating known principles.
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests

The Associate Editor has also made the following comments:

1. Especially discuss more about a queastion: how this case make a diggerence to clinical practice and about it’s diagnostic or any clinical value
In clinical practice it is important to recognize that these lesions are benign conditions and surgical excision usually with curettage is the treatment of choice. ABCs differential diagnosis from osteosarcomas is the most important clinical aspect because osteosarcomas must be treated with surgical excision and chemotherapy and have different prognosis and incidence of recurrences.

2. Improve figure legends and mark them on figures for clarity and in order to serve to all readers.

Changes have been made and the revised figures have been uploaded.

3. In keeping with the journal style please revise the references.

Changes have been made.

Version 7: 23 October 2010