Reviewer's report

Title: Axial Torsion of Meckel's Diverticulum. A Rare Complication of a Common Variant: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 25 December 2010

Reviewer: Sumiya Ishigami

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors showed a rare case of axial torsion of Meckel's diverticulum successfully treated with emergency laparotomy. As the authors presented, axial torsion of Meckel's diverticulum is a rare, it is worth to report in this journal. However many points must be corrected.

1) The weakest point of this report is unclear intraoperative picture. If not, there is no evidence of axial torsion and it is not worth to accept. How about the fine picture of resected specimen.

2) Too long discussion. Please condense within 1 page.

3) Please show the findings of preoperative examination (US and or CT and inflammatory condition). Then please state preoperative diagnosis.
Quality of written English: Acceptable