Reviewer's report

**Title:** Sitagliptin is effective and safe with type 1 or type 2 diabetic patients without endogenous insulin secretion: a case report

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 16 November 2010

**Reviewer:** Miyakawa Gaku

**Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?:** Other

**If other, please specify:**

possible novel glucose lowering effect of sitagliptin

**Has the case been reported coherently?:** Yes

**Is the case report authentic?:** Yes

**Is the case report ethical?:** Yes

**Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?:** Yes

**Is this case worth reporting?:** Yes

**Is the case report persuasive?:** Yes

**Does the case report have explanatory value?:** No

**Does the case report have diagnostic value?:** No

**Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?:** Yes

**Is the anonymity of the patient protected?:** Yes

**Comments to authors:**

The author is addressing very interesting hypotheses with respect to the effects of sitagliptin with patients who have no insulin secretion. Although the exact therapeutic implications and safety of sitagliptin (or other incretin-related drugs) on such patients are unknown, I think this work may expand the usage of sitagliptin (or other DPP-IV inhibitors) and further may reveal the novel pathways of this drug. However, the author (and the readers of this article) should keep in mind that this work is just an observational case report with three patients.
I have a number of comments below.

1) Recently in Japan, it was reported that liraglutide (one of the GLP-1 analogs) was switched from insulin and the patients had severe DKA (diabetic keto-acidosis). One should keep in mind that incretin-related therapies can not replace insulin with the those who has no insulin secretion. With such subjects, this kind of therapy can be used as add on to insulin. Therefore, to make sure that the readers of this paper will get this point, the author should stress this in discussion.

2) All abbreviations should be explained when they first used or should be included in the abbreviations section.

3) The author investigated the change of glycemic parameters as well as body weigh and gastro-intestinal problems. Did the author check if some other basic measures (for example blood pressure) were influenced after sitagliptin?

4) The discussion needs to be tidied up and expanded a bit and there should probably be some further discussion of other DDP-IV inhibitors.

5) In my opinion, the conclusion made by the author is too solid based on observational study with 3 cases. Consider re-writing.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.