Reviewer's report

Title: Abscopal effect of radiation on lung metastases of hepatocellular carcinoma - A case report

Version: 2 Date: 7 July 2010

Reviewer: Dora Kwong

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

It is an interesting case report and the reported abscopal effect is unusual. One question that needs to be clarified: Was there any histological confirmation of hepatocellular carcinoma relapse of the lung or mediastinal lesion? What was the APF level? Patient also had a second relapse in a gastric lymph node, again was there any histological proof or marker evidence of recurrent hepatocellular carcinoma before radiotherapy? If the diagnosis of recurrence is only radiological, there may be other explanation for the disappearance of all lesions after radiotherapy.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'