Reviewer’s report

Title: Abscopal effect of radiation on lung metastases of hepatocellular carcinoma - A case report

Version: 2 Date: 6 July 2010

Reviewer: Roland Leung

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The clinical outcome of the patient is indeed interesting. I would like to comment that the cross radiation field for the mediastinal met is very close to the peripheral lung met. Can there not be scatter effects of the radiation which will affect the peripheral met? The abscopal effect would be much more convincing if there is no side radiation. I am not a radiation oncologist but I would like this to be explained.

In addition, is there any pathology from the mediastinal mass proving it is HCC?

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published