Reviewer's report

Title: Eschar and neck lymphadenopathy caused by francisella tularensis after tick bite: a case report.

Version: 2 Date: 30 June 2010

Reviewer: Maarten Limper

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The description of this sporadic case of tularemia in France is of importance, as the incidence in this country is relatively low - though increasing - with about a 100 cases in 2008, mostly associated with occupational risks. This case report will make local physicians more aware of the possibility of tularemia in patients who have not been in close contact with animals.

The authors state that this is the first report of SENLAT infection caused by F. tularensis. I'd like to make to comments on this statement.

1. The added value of concepts of first TIBOLA and DEBONEL, and later SENLAT, are questionable. These terms were coined as circumspect syndromes with a scalp lesion caused by a tick and concomittant infection with either a
Rickettsia spp. or B. henselae, with lymphadenopathy. Now this case illustrates another possible pathogen, resulting in the same symptoms. But isn't this the case in many vector-borne infections? Lymphadenopathy after a tick- or mosquito bite is a common finding, and in my opinion the location of the bite is of less importance and does not lead to a specific syndrome.

2. However, if you decide to embrace the concept of SENLAT, in this case transmission by a tick has not been confirmed. Although most cases of tularemia in French can be linked to ticks, one can not be sure about the vector unless a tick is found and F. tularensis is isolated from it.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests