Reviewer’s report

Title: Giant basilar aneurysm treated by sole-stenting technique: 10 years follow-up

Version: 2 Date: 8 April 2008

Reviewer: Isabel Wanke

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is a well written case report on a patient with a giant basilar aneurysm treated 10 years ago using a stent alone.

The aneurysm disappeared completely in the follow up period and obviously stayed stable for 10 years now.

The report is very interesting since we know from giant aneurysm that they tend to recur after coiling. Obviously flow alteration was indeed the curative concept in this case.

I would recommend publication of this report.

Some recommendations:

1. The authors should mentioned the initial symptoms of the patient.
2. The authors should shortly describe which mechanical procedure they used to reopen the basilar artery after thrombosis, was there any adjunct medical therapy?
3. I do not agree with the authors hypothesis of progressive vessel correction of
the basilar course.

First: after stenting a vessel it will straighten depending on the type of stent used independent of the flow alterations. Second, the aneurysm was absorbed over the years so that the mechanical pressure relieved and third, the projections given in figure 3 are not the same. There are different ways to interpret the change of a vessel course. The authors therefore should discuss these points and eliminate figure 3.

4. The discussion should be shortened.
5. Figure 1 Figure 2 E and F should be eliminated (no additional information)

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.