Reviewer's report

Title: Case report of an incidental giant oncocytoma.

Version: 3 Date: 20 March 2010

Reviewer: Sunitha Jacob

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
1) TITLE -The word ‘kidney’ or ‘renal’ should be mentioned in the title as oncocytoma is known to occur in other sites as well.
2) LANGUAGE- Please rephrase the text accordingly.
3) ABSTRACT – Rephrase sentence 3 of introduction.
   -in case presentation mention the final diagnosis.
4) INTRODUCTION- No references have been given.
5) CASE PRESENTATION – The sex of the patient is not mentioned.
   -Please specify the indication for ultrasound abdomen ;diabetes is not an indication.
- Delete ‘few days later’ in line 6.
- What was the preoperative diagnosis?
- The dimensions of the mass to be written as ‘16.5x13.9cm and ‘27x16x13cm’.
- The mean diameter need not be mentioned.
- Try to provide images of the immunohistochemistry.

6) DISCUSSION – The key essence of this paper is the very large of this tumor. Hence the paper should give emphasis on the other reported cases of giant oncocytomas rather than on the cytogenetics as this has not been done in the present case.
- Discussion needs to be expanded.
- No references have been placed in the text.

7) CONCLUSION – Rephrase the sentences so that they are not a copy of the same as in the abstract.

8) REFERENCES – Please use the correct style.

9) FIGURE LEGEND- Provide the details of the MRI scan.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'