Author's response to reviews

Title: Case report of an incidental giant renal oncocytoma.

Authors:

    Anastasios AA Anastasiadis (dranastasiadis@yahoo.gr)
    Georgios GD Dimitriadis (gdimit@auth.gr)
    Dimitrios DR Radopoulos (dradopoulos@hotmail.gr)

Version: 4 Date: 12 April 2010

Author's response to reviews:

Point by point response

Referee 2;

- More cross references of similar could make the report more presentable.

Other publications comparing the other larger oncocytomas would make the case
report more comparable to other similar previous articles.

We have added other publications comparing the other 3 largest oncocytomas

Referee 1;

- 1) TITLE - The word ‘kidney’ or ‘renal’ should be mentioned in the title as
oncocytoma is known to occur in other sites as well.

The word renal is mentioned

2) LANGUAGE- Please rephrase the text accordingly.

The text has been rephrased.

3) ABSTRACT – Rephrase sentence 3 of introduction.

Sentence 3 has been rephrased.
- in case presentation mention the final diagnosis.

The final diagnosis is mentioned.

4) INTRODUCTION- No references have been given.

We have references in the introduction, ref [1] and [2].

5) CASE PRESENTATION – The sex of the patient is not mentioned.

The sex is mentioned (male)

- Please specify the indication for ultrasound abdomen; diabetes is not an indication.

The indication is chronic abdominal discomfort.

- Delete ‘few days later’ in line 6.

'Few days later’ is deleted.

- What was the preoperative diagnosis?

The preoperative diagnosis was Renal Cell Carcinoma.

- The dimensions of the mass to be written as ‘16.5x13.9cm and ‘27x16x13cm’.

The dimensions are 16.5x13.9 and 27x16x13.

- The mean diameter need not be mentioned.

The mean diameter is not mentioned.

- Try to provide images of the immunohistochemistry.

No images of immunohistochemistry are available.
6) DISCUSSION – The key essence of this paper is the very large of this tumor. Hence the paper should give emphasis on the other reported cases of giant oncocytomas rather than on the cytogenetics as this has not been done in the present case.

We have reported the other 3 largest oncocytomas in the literature.

- Discussion needs to be expanded.

Discussion is expanded.

- No references have been placed in the text.

We have placed references in the text.

7) CONCLUSION – Rephrase the sentences so that they are not a copy of the same as in the abstract.

Sentences are rephrased.

8) REFERENCES – Please use the correct style.

The correct style has been used.

9) FIGURE LEGEND- Provide the details of the MRI scan.

We have provided details of the MRI scan.