Reviewer’s report

Title: Volcano-like intermittent bleeding activity for 7 years from an arterio-enteric fistula on the kidney graft site after pancreas-kidney transplantation

Version: 2 Date: 9 February 2010

Reviewer: Dean Kim

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is an interesting case where an arterio-enteric fistula occurred from a nonfunctioning kidney allograft. Our group has seen this occur from a pancreas allograft, but never from the kidney. However, I do not believe one can conclude from this case report that the intermittent bleeding occurred from this fistula. The case report was coherent, but I was disappointed at the brevity of the discussion. In addition, I believe that your conclusion, although well intentioned, might be a little strong given your case report. I would try and improve the discussion and try and soften your conclusion (regarding removing the first kidney allograft at the time of the second kidney transplant).

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.