Reviewer’s report

Title: A case of acute hydrothorax complicating peritoneal dialysis

Version: 2 Date: 15 June 2010

Reviewer: Cheuk Chun C Szeto

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is a case of pleuro-peritoneal communication in PD. The interesting point is actually the patient had successful PD 17 years ago but had fistula noted soon after PD now. Unfortunately, the authors pay little attention to this very fact. I think the report is suitable for publish, provided that the authors could provide additional details about the PD that the patient had 17 years ago, including:
- duration of PD
- cycle volume (and patient’s body weight at that time)
- manual or cycler assisted
- chest trauma / diaphragmatic surgery in the past 17 years

I suspect the previous course of PD was performed in small volume (so that PPF was not noted). This point should be highlighted in the discussion.
Quality of written English: Acceptable