Reviewers report

Title: Successful treatment of refractory pleural effusion due to systemic AL amyloidosis by vincristine adriamycin dexamethasone chemotherapy: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 24 January 2010

Reviewer: Konstantinos Kostikas

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Presentations, diagnoses and/or management of new and emerging diseases

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

In this manuscript Araoka and co-workers present a case of bilateral pleural effusion in a patient with systemic amyloidosis that they managed with systemic chemotherapy. The case-report is well written, the clinical course of the patient is well-described, the management is rare and of clinical interest. However, the authors should avoid being so conclusive about the management of pleural effusions with the specific chemotherapy regimen based on a single patient. My specific comments for the authors are the following:

• The authors suggest that the echocardiogram findings were indicative of infiltrative cardiomyopathy. However, in the possible mechanisms of action of
chemotherapy in this patient, they do not refer to the possible effect of chemotherapy on the possible myocardial infiltration.

• What was the course of the patient between the diagnosis and initial management (in 1999) and today? More details should be provided.

• The authors should be more speculative and less definite in their conclusions, since they are referring to the management of a single patient, who luckily enough did not develop any side effects from chemotherapy.

• The title of the case report is not very accurate. A possible alternative would "successful management" or "response".

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests