Reviewer’s report

Title: Paroxysmal Autonomic Instability with Dystonia in a Patient with Tuberculous Meningitis: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 5 December 2009

Reviewer: Ashish Goel

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Major comments

• In the second paragraph on page 4, it is mentioned that the XR showed bilateral nodular changes, yet the diagnosis of community acquired pneumonia was made. It is not usual for nodular changes on both sides to be interpreted as CAP.
• Page 4, paragraph 2 – was CT or MRI not considered/done at the time when the patient was suspected to have encephalitis?
• Page 5, paragraph 1 – The repeat XR showed bilateral infiltration of the upper lobes. No mention is made of the bilateral nodules that were seen in the previous film.
• Page 5, paragraph 1 – The CT scan of the brain showed tuberculomas – were
these sufficient to explain the left hemiparesis that has been described in the clinical presentation or was there a clinico-radiological disparity

- The consent of the patient or family has not been obtained – while the patient died the family could not be traced. However, due to the rarity of the condition as described by the authors themselves, the identity of the subject may not be completely concealed.

Minor comments

- Page 6, paragraph 2 – the word ‘already’ may be deleted
- Page 8, paragraph 3, line 1 – Use of ‘besides…’ instead of ‘next to…’ is preferred
- Table 2 – Under infectious diseases ‘meningitis’ should read ‘Meningitis’

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests' below