Reviewer's report

Title: A Neonate with Left Pulmonary Artery Thrombosis and Left Lung Hypoplasia: A Case Report

Version: 2 Date: 2 March 2010

Reviewer: Joshua Attridge

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Findings that shed new light on the possible pathogenesis of a disease or an adverse effect

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The timing of the studies in the first portion of the (echocardiogram and CTA) should be explicitly stated (ie ** hours postnatally).

The authors state that aortopulmonary collaterals were seen to supply the L lung in their discussion. It would be helpful to include an image showing this after Figure 3.

The authors did not include the following case report which describes a similar event to the one in this manuscript. As such the introduction and abstract should be altered to include this earlier report:

Lytrivi I, Reingold S, Ramaswamy P. Pediatr Cardiol. 2008
Neonatal left pulmonary artery occlusion and postinfarction cysts of the left lung: cause and effect?

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests