Reviewer's report

Title: A Neonate with Left Pulmonary Artery Thrombosis and Left Lung Hypoplasia: A Case Report

Version: 2 Date: 15 February 2010

Reviewer: Anne Greenough

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected association between diseases or symptoms

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors report a case in which there was left lung hypoplasia and a left pulmonary artery thrombosis; they postulate that an intrauterine insult occurred between the fifth and eight weeks of gestation.

Comments:

1. If a thrombosis had occurred at 5-8 weeks of gestation it seems unlikely that the thrombosis would still be present some 30 weeks later.

2. Idiopathic unilateral pulmonary hypoplasia does occur. An alternative explanation for the findings is there was abnormal pulmonary vasculature associated with abnormal lung development and at some point late in gestation a thrombin formed.
3. The authors do not present the results of antithrombin, protein C, protein S or factor V Leiden levels. Nor indeed if these were repeated as levels taken in the neonatal period are difficult to interpret. What are the authors’ lab’s normal ranges?

4. Much of the report of the course of the case could be omitted.

5. In the discussion the authors state congenital pulmonary hypoplasia occurs when any or a combination of factors is absent or impaired. Unilateral pulmonary hypoplasia has other explanations or may be idiopathic.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests