Reviewer's report

Title: Typical Parkinsonism with an atypical cause: Case Report

Version: 2 Date: 31 October 2009

Reviewer: Richard Rison

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

I have reviewed the manuscript by Dr. Hortelano and colleagues entitled "Typical Parkinsonism with and Atypical Cause: A Case Report.

General Comments:

This is an interesting case report of parkinsonism secondary to brain metastasis from colon carcinoma. While not unique, it does represent an unusual manifestation of a disease process. There are structural and grammatical errors that will need to be addresses prior to publication. Also, the authors need to expand on the history and neurologic exam a bit more and address whether or not certain labs were checked. Abbreviations need to be defined, and references need to be bracketed in the text.

Specific Recommendations:
1. Consider changing the title to "Central Nervous System Metastatic Lesions as a cause of Parkinsonism: A Case Report".

2. P. 2 in the Abstract: change 1st sentence to "Colorectal cancer is one of the most common diseases in the world, and approximately 20% of patients harbor metastatic disease at diagnosis".

3. P. 2 in the Abstract: change the word "hemyparesia" to "hemiparesis".

4. P. 2 in the Abstract: The last sentence in the introduction should be "There are few reports of secondary parkinsonism from brain tumor-related mass effect."

5. P. 2 in the Abstract in the case report section: should be "...who presented with bilateral...initial presentation of his..." "...deteriorated rapidly and became bedbound and akinetic.

6. P. 2 in the Abstract conclusion: should be "Given the rapid clinical progression of our patient's neurologic symptoms, clinicians should be aware of this atypical presentation of secondary parkinsonism."

7. P. 3 in the second paragraph of the introduction: The word "hemyparesia" should be "hemiparesis".

8. P. 3 second paragraph in the introduction: should be "...brain lesions with mass effect without known tumor." and should be "...or the striatonigral tract, but occasionally no lesion is identified."

9. P. 3 second paragraph change the phrase "In this last case we assume that mass efect..." to "When lesions are identified we assume that mass effect plays an important pathologic role." and end the introduction here.

10. P. 3 case report 1st sentence should be " A 57 year old..." "...and diffuse abdominal pain for two months prior". "The abdominal pain was predominately located in the left flank with associated swelling". "Laboratory investigations detected moderate anemia with hemoglobin..." "Further tests including colonoscopy revealed..."

11. P.4 case report 1st paragraph should be " The computed tomography (CT) body scan...involving the liver and multiple lymph nodes."

12. Define "TNM" and "AJCC". "six" should be "sixth".

13. P.4 case report "...palliative surgical treatment via an ileocolic bypass with primary anastomosis..."

14. P.4 case report should be "He worsened rapidly secondary to high fever and testicular pain with tenderness suggesting orchitis." "He was admitted again and intravenous..." delete the phrase "at hospital". "Spontaneous drainage of a scrotal abscess improved...and the patient was discharged." "...the last three days of hospitalization he developed a progressive gait disturbance with small steps, mild motor slowness, clumsiness, and mild generalized rigidity." "...following days after discharge and he developed bilateral bradykinesia, postural instability, and a wide-based gait with freezing and needed assistance with activities of daily living."

15. In the last paragraph P.4 case report section change the phrase "When this
family consulted us..." to "General physical and neurologic examination revealed..." and please also comment on the general physical exam regarding vital signs. In the neurologic examination please comment on cranial nerves including any gaze palsies, mask-like facies...etc. Also, was there any papilledema?

16. P.4 case report section should be: "Obvious pulsion was not observed but he adopted a bilateral dystonic posture. We observed..."...although he displayed delayed answers and appeared disinterested." "His family reported nighttime urinary incontinence and complete dependence on activities if daily living."

17. P.5 first paragraph "...brain lesions with contrast enhancement and mass effect..."; "Despite initial benefit from steroids, rapid worsening ensued without time for radiotherapy or a trial L-DOPA." Please also define "L-DOPA".

18. P.5 Discussion : "In a retrospective series..." "The patient at diagnosis suffered from advanced...." "It is probable...suggestive of metastasis was due to both physical and psychological stressors secondary to high disease burden."

19. P.6 1st paragraph "The first case secondary parkinsonism due to brain lesions from tuberculosis..." "...described in the literature as secondary to ...
""...one-sided" should be "unilateral".

20. P.6 2nd paragraph should be "In our case of disseminated brain metastasis, although not visualized in the basal ganglia via CT scanning, it was felt that microscopic infiltration with secondary compressive effects occurred."

21. P.7 1st paragraph "Our patient suffered from multiple brain metastasis involving the bilateral cerebral hemispheres..." "Although we didn't detect via CT scan any lesions involving the basal ganglia, it highly unlikely that our patient had an early phase of idiopathic Parkinsons disease." "The rapid progression of neurologic symptoms and subsequent advanced..."

Please put reference numbers in brackets (instead of superscripts) as per journal style.

Also, please include in the history if the patient had been given any neuroleptics or Reglan. Was a serum paraneoplastic panel checked? Was a TSH checked? Was there a family history of Parkinsons disease?

Please place arrows in the figures demonstrating the mass lesions.

Richard A. Rison, M.D., F.A.A.N.E.M.
Medical Director Presbyterian Intercommunity Hospital Stroke Center
Clinical Assistant Professor of Neurology
University of Southern California
Keck School of Medicine
Los Angeles County Medical Center
Neurology Consultants Medical Group
12291 E. Washington Blvd. Suite #303
Whittier, California
90606
T: 562-698-6296
F: 562-693-6752
Email: rison@usc.edu
http://www.pih.net/
http://www.usc.edu/schools/medicine/
http://www.lacusc.org/

This message is a PRIVATE communication from Neurology Consultants Medical Group and may contain information that is privileged, confidential and is intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible for delivering the message to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender, then delete it from your system. Thank you.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.