Reviewer’s report

Title: Semi-invasive aspergillosis in an immunocompetent patient with Swyer-James-MacLeod Syndrome: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 19 March 2009

Reviewer: Juerg Hamacher

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors report on an association of infective complication in a rather rare syndrome that may have in common with COPD some features, i.e. Swyer-James-MacLeod Syndrome. the syndrome might have some problems with infection, such as abscess, non-tuberculous mycobacterial infection, and so on, and the difference between a full syndrome and segmental emphysema is an entity also discussed in the literature, meaning that there might be common features with COPD.

The whole text might profit in clearer discussion of the problems of that syndrome population, it is not yet finalized (comments are in the text, etc.). I would like to have an answer whether your special aspergillus species is a) giving similar
aspergillus immune reaction results (are they in part negative as the species is not cross-reactive or as they are really negative?) and b) whether Itraconazole is a reasonable drug, and I would give half a sentence on itraconazole pharmacological problems.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

no competing interests!