Reviewer's report

Title: Dentin dysplasia type I: a case report

Version: 5 Date: 24 March 2009

Reviewer: Rita Depprich

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

As the presented case is neither original nor interesting and doesn´t contribute significantly to medical knowledge authors should discuss the following aspects:

Swelling of the patient´s gingiva in several occasions (page 1, lines 17-19): How can this be explained? (Infection of the cyst? Disposition?..)

First generation sufferer (page 4, lines 14-15): How can this be explained? (Mutation? Incidence?)

What do the authors expect of their treatment plan (page 3, lines 5-10)? What treatment may be helpful to delay loss of teeth (page 3, lines 24-25, page 4, line 1)?

Did the authors treat the cyst in the left mandible in any special way (antibiotics,
bone graft/substitute, ...)?


What is meant by effective preventive treatment (page 5, line 14)? Further explanation is needed.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests