Reviewer's report

Title: Primary tubercular liver abscess in an immunocompetent adult: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 7 November 2008

Reviewer: Alok Sharma

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The report is in general well written, however there are few points which the authors should pay attention to:

1. Please elaborate the abbreviation TLA in the abstract also.
2. Authors report that the size of liver as well as that of the abscess have reduced after 6 weeks of anti tubercular therapy. An ultrasound/CT documentation of the same (image) and the extent to which this reduction has occurred should also be mentioned in the report. This will help us to know the pattern of clinical response in patients with this rare presentation.
3. Authors use the term imunocompetent"in the title. What other investigations (besides HIV testing)/clinical features led to the impression that this patient was
immunocompetent. Immunocompetency/deficiency are important clinical statements and should only be used when there is ample evidence supporting it and this should be clearly documented.

4. The image of USG film is of suboptimal quality. A better image should be supplied if possible.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'