Reviewer’s report

Title: MALT lymphoma presenting within a solitary anti-mesenteric dilated segment of ileum: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 28 September 2008

Reviewer: Antonio Marte

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

- The Authors state that the Meckel diverticulum presents always eterotopic mucosa: this is not true even so about 60% of MD presents with eterotopic tissue. “ Snyder C L: Meckel’s Diverticulum in Grosfeld JL, O’Neill JA, Fonkalsrud EW, Coran AG. “Pediatric Surgery” Sixth edition Mosby 2006 Vol II pagg 1304-1312
- The Authors should specify the stains utilized and the positivity for the diagnosis of MALT-Lymphoma.
- Have they considered the possibility of an intestinal duplication and the differential diagnosis?
- How far was the ML from the ileocecal valve?
Quality of written English: Acceptable