Reviewer's report

Title: Femoral nerve compression secondary to ganglion cyst arising from hip joint: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 19 September 2008

Reviewer: Francesco Oliva

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

In my opinion this case report is unusual only for the clinical presentation, because the literature is plenty of case reports about ganglions around the hip. Aniway it is well write but poor in some points. Thus they have to:

1) Add more bibliography about ganglion and hip. Some examples:


b) J South Orthop Assoc. 2001 Spring;10(1):1-5; discussion 5. Ganglion of the


3) Why they have not talk the role of US in the diagnosis if they have done an ecocolor doppler for a differential diagnosis?

They need revisited the manuscript

Best Regards

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'