Reviewer's report

Title: Invasive Pulmonary Aspergillosis -10 years post Bone Marrow Transplantation: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 15 July 2008

Reviewer: Bobbak Vahid

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Unfortunately authors failed to confirm the diagnosis of invasive pulmonary aspergillosis. Because the authors are claiming that their case is the first reported invasive pulmonary aspergillosis that has happened years after bone marrow transplantataion and years off immunosuppresive medications, firm documentation of the disease by biopsy is necessary.

Radiographic findings, sputum culture and serology are not diagnostic of invasive pulmonary aspergillosis.

The Authors were vague about the previous and recurent episodes of "chest infections". The is no discussion regarding possibilty of neutrophil dysfunction, relation between low IgG leves and pulmonary aspergillosis.

The authors also did not adquately explore and did not exclude other possible etiologies of lung disease in this patients.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.