Reviewer's report

Title: Erythromelalgia, a rare condition: a case report and review of the literature.

Version: 1 Date: 29 December 2008

Reviewer: Stephen Waxman

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This case report describes a patient with erythromelalgia (termed erythermalgia by some authorities). It is clearly written, but could be strengthened in the following ways:

1. Family history should be specified, since about 10-15% of cases of EM are familial.

2. The text states that Cummins et al (2004) "suggested" that mutations producing familial EM shift activation of Nav1.7 in a hyperpolarizing direction. They did not suggest this, but rather showed it, in a definitive manner, using patch clamp to examine the voltage-dependence and kinetics of activation and inactivation in the mutated channels.

3. The text similarly states that Dib-Hajj et al (2005) "suggested" another
mutation in Nav1.7 as causing EM in another kindred. Again, Dib-Hajj et al did not suggest this, but rather demonstrated it, via sequencing and then functional analysis of the mutant channel. In this case, the kindred was a large one, containing more than a dozen subjects with EM, and the mutation segregated precisely with phenotype.


Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.