Reviewer's report

Title: Insulin dependent diabetes mellitus in a patient with Kearns-Sayre Syndrome: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 9 December 2008

Reviewer: Marek Niedziela

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

Report on the rare syndrome which is known for many pediatricians and internists but not considered quite frequently in the differential diagnosis.

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General comment: This case report on Kearns-Sayre syndrome, a rare genetic disorder, is a descriptive article with unfortunately no new findings, ideas. The title is focused on the insulin dependent diabetes mellitus but in fact the main conclusion is that it is worthy to screen for the Toni-Debre-Fanconi Syndrome. This makes the reader somehow confused. I would say that rather patients with the Toni-Debre-Fanconi should be suspected maybe for Kearns-Sayre syndrome.
and such a conclusion would be of greater importance for practitioners.

Detailed comments: Introduction and discussion are rather poor. If the diagnosis is so easy why this patient was not diagnosed for such many years!
The molecular aspects were not properly described. In the OMIM base there is no one gene described in which the deletions occur but it is a base with a total description of the disease and the review of the literature (see introduction). There is no one gene in which deletions occur in KSS as proposed in this paper. There is no any lab test attached in the form e.g. of table. If authors do not show the deletion they should not state it was detected!
The picture of the patient is really typical in terms of short stature, ptosis, neuromuscular problems. However authors are only descriptive - only ECG was provided.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'