Reviewer's report

Title: Giant Pyogenic Granuloma of the Thigh: A Case Report.

Version: 2 Date: 15 February 2008

Reviewer: Alena Salim

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

1) The lesions looks very infected and this may be contributing to it's large size. Had the patient been treated prior to her admission with either oral antibiotics or 'home' topical therapies -this should be included in the case report if so.

2) Was infection (bacterial, atypical fungal and mycobacteria) confidently excluded by either swabs, special stains and culture. Bartonella spp. has been mentioned as a cause for pyogenic granuloma like lesions in HIV patients but this hasn't been documented as being excluded in this case. Were the organisms looked for with Warthin-Starry silver staining and was the patients bloods checked for Bartonella specific Ig antibodies.

3) I am not sure what the arrow on Figure 3 is pointing to - perhaps this could be clarified or the arrow removed.

4) The patient's CD4 count and viral load should be included

5) Perhaps part of the 'background' should be incorporated more into a 'discussion' after the case report and before a shorter 'conclusion'.

6) The discussion needs to be elaborated and a hypothesis proposed as to why...
this lesion should occur in this particular patient someone with HIV, why so big and why at the donor site.

7) The histology picture needs further text to explain what the picture shows since it doesn’t show the typical lobulated structures at this power.

**What next?:** Revise and resubmit

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable