Reviewer’s report

Title: Managing a locally advanced malignant thymoma complicated by nephrotic syndrome - a challenging scenario.

Version: 3 Date: 16 January 2008

Reviewer: Paul Cockwell

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

I think it is important for the reading of this article by a non-renal specialist to bring out the point that acute renal failure (or acute kidney injury (AKI)), which this patient had, is not caused by minimal change nephropathy except when there is complicating pathology. I suspect that the kidney had sustained some acute tubular injury. As a second possibility, although pretty remote and impossible in this case to substantiate a renal vein thrombosis as a complication of the nephrotic syndrome can cause acute renal failure. This point needs to be clearly made.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable