Reviewer's report

Title: Managing a locally advanced malignant thymoma complicated by nephrotic syndrome - a challenging scenario.

Version: 2 Date: 20 November 2007

Reviewer: Paul Cockwell

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This case report should be revised with specialist nephrology input. There are a number of issues that are not addressed in the manuscript that relate to this.

For example:
- Why did the patient have acute renal failure with a minimal change nephropathy
- Is Cockroft Gault validated for renal function in this setting
- Could the anti-cancer treatment have contributed to remission of the nephrotic syndrome
- What is the literature on (i) renal disease with thymoma and (ii) associations between MCN and nephrotic syndrome.
- What is the referenced literature for dose reductions of these drugs in the setting of renal disease
- What additional considerations are important when dose adjusting in a patient with a nephrotic syndrome

I'd suggest that the authors ask a nephrologist at their centre for guidance
(perhaps the one who provided renal management). This individual should be added as a co-author if they make a significant contribution to the revision.

**What next?:** Revise and resubmit

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable