Reviewer’s report

Title: Hepatic abscess in a pre-existed simple hepatic cyst, as a late complication of sigmoid colon ruptured diverticula.

Version: 2 Date: 10 November 2007

Reviewer: Ioannis Koutroubakis

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General

The authors present a case of hepatic abscess in a pre-existed simple hepatic cyst as a late complication of sigmoid colon ruptured diverticula. Although several cases of hepatic abscess as complications of diverticulosis have been described it is an interesting case report. However, there are some weaknesses which need to be addressed in order to strengthen the manuscript.

Revisions necessary for publication

1. The duration of the use of antibiotics during and after the first hospitalization of the patient should be defined.

2. Hepatic abscess without fever is extremely rare. Since the authors do not report fever of the patient during the second hospitalization they should mention and discuss about the absence of fever.

3. The development of hepatic abscess in a pre-existed simple hepatic cyst should be discussed in more detail. How often and when simple hepatic cyst are
infected?

**What next?:** Accept after minor revisions

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published