Reviewer's report

Title: Unusual presentation of Basilar artery stroke secondary to patent foramen ovale: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 15 October 2007

Reviewer: Bibiana Cujec

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

Revisions necessary for publication

This 45 year old woman had an unusual presentation of presumed embolic stroke.

Patent foramen ovale is a common finding in the normal population and is associated with increased risk of stroke. The causative association in this case would be strengthened by presence of a deep vein thrombosis or actual presence of clot in the right atrium. Is there any further follow up of this patient after device closure of patent foramen ovale?

Was there a large right to left shunt with saline contrast during normal respiration and/or with Valsalva release? What was the atrial septal separation on transesophageal echocardiogram?

How common is it for cardioembolic stroke to affect the posterior circulation?
What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Acceptable