Reviewer's report

Title: Combined maxillomandibular swing approach and neurosurgical ultrasonic aspirator for extensive Clival chordoma: a case presentation.

Version: 3 Date: 24 September 2007

Reviewer: Adriano Piattelli

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General
In the present case report the Authors describe a new surgical approach for an extensive chordoma extending to the brainstem and to the nasopharynx.

Unfortunately there are still several typo errors and English misusage.

Should the Authors be willing to provide the suggested minor revisions, publication can be recommended.

--------------------

Revisions necessary for publication

- Introduction, page 3, lines 3-4: “...occur in male and 40 years and above age group”. Please, rephrase and add a reference.

- Introduction, page 4, lines 1-2: “..or gamma knife radiosurgery often used...”. Please, add a verb and a reference.

- Introduction, page 4, line 3-5: Please, add a reference.

- Case presentation, page 5, line 7: Please, add a verb.
- Case presentation, page 6, lines 6-7: Please, rephrase.
- Discussion, page 7, lines 1-2: “...which arise from notochord and derived...”. Please, replace with “…and derive.”
- Discussion, page 7, lines 3-5: “CT scan and MRI....tumor”. Please, add a reference.
- Discussion, page 7 lines 7-9: “Immunohistochemistry…to S-100 antibodies”. Please, add a reference.
- Discussion, page 8, lines 2-5: “There has....difficult”. Please, rephrase and add a reference.
- Discussion, page 8, lines 4-6: “Palliative....system”. Please, add a reference.
- Discussion, page 8, lines 7-8: Please, rephrase.
- Discussion, page 8, lines 8-10: Please, add a reference.
- Discussion, page 8, line 14: “…which it able...”. Please, replace “it” with “is”.
- Please spell out at first use CT (page 3, line 1), CSF (page 6, line 13), MRI (page 7, line 6).
- When a brand name is cited, please supply the manufacturer’s name and address (city and state/country) as stated in the Authors instructions.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published