Reviewer's report

Title: Port site herniation of the small bowel following laparoscopy-assisted distal gastrectomy.

Version: 8 Date: 13 October 2007

Reviewer: Gianlorenzo Dionigi

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

RE: 'Port site herniation of the small bowel following laparoscopy-assisted distal gastrectomy.' By Tsuyoshi Itoh, Nobuaki Fuji, Hiroki Taniguchi, Taiji Watanabe, Toshiyuki Kosuga, Kingo Kashimoto and Kazuyo Naito

Journal of Medical Case Reports

Summary

The Authors describe unique case and rare clinical presentation of port site herniation of the small bowel following laparoscopy-assisted distal gastrectomy.

Trocar-site incisional hernias and their complications are reported in 1% to 6% of patients. Such hernias are attributed to the difficulty of applying standard suturing techniques to wound closure.

The main objective of this review is to critically evaluate the fact that trocar-site incisional hernias have a difficult clinical and radiologic diagnosis.

Unique and detailed data including radiologic and pathologic figures are presented in this paper.

The existence is undoubtedly of interest to the clinician (general surgeon).
A brief Literature review of this case is reported and clinical implications examined.
Few cases have been previously described in the English-language literature. An additional one is presented.

Major Compulsory Revisions
I enjoyed reviewing the paper ‘Port site herniation of the small bowel following laparoscopy-assisted distal gastrectomy’ by Tsuyoshi Itoh
I have the following questions and suggestions for the authors:
• The Authors should provide Reference of the first sentence in the Introduction Section: “Bowel herniation .... after laparoscopic surgery”.
• The Authors should provide Reference of the second sentence in the Introduction Section: “Although port site ..... of trocar sites”.
• Please specify type of lymphatic dissection (D1/D2/D3) in surgery for gastric cancer
• I am happy that recent References are used Discussion Section. Infact about all references are less than 9 years old. A good literature search was performed for articles dealing with closure techniques. In particular the recent paper of Shaher (Surg Endosc. 2007 Aug;21(8):1264-74) is quite interesting.

I think that the paper describes an interesting report. I think that the Editors should not minimize the potential interest such a report will generate. Therefore, with the questions above answered by the Authors, I would support publication for this investigation. I would be interested in reviewing the paper again if you address these points raised by the reviewers; please understand I make no assurance as to final Editorial decision.

Gianlorenzo Dionigi

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published