Reviewer's report

Title: Case Report: Papillary cancer in thyroglossal duct cyst

Version: 5 Date: 7 August 2007

Reviewer: Izumi Takeyoshi

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General
This is a case report of papillary cancer in thyroglossal duct cyst. About 1% of thyroglossal duct cystes are histologically malignant, and about 80% of these cases are papillary carcinomas of the thyroid gland type. About 150 malignant cases of the thyroglossal duct cyst papillary carcinoma have been reported to date in the world literature. Papillary cancer in thyroglossal duct cyst is rare. This case report is acceptable after the major revision.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Revisions necessary for publication

Major
1. The authors performed total thyroidectomy and bilateral neck dissection after revealing that the histopathological diagnosis of the thyroglossal duct cyst was papillary carcinoma. An 8mm in size papillary carcinoma was found in the left lobe of the thyroid tissue. But some researchers have reported that the Sistrunk operation is adequate for most patients with incidentally diagnosed thyroglossal duct cyst carcinoma in the presence of a clinically and radiologically normal
You should show us the data that you selected total thyroidectomy and bilateral neck dissection when the thyroglossal duct cyst was malignant. Review the literature on the thyroglossal duct cyst cancer accompanied by papillary cancer of the thyroid.

2. How did you decide to perform initial lymph node dissection?
Patal AG, et al. reported that initial node dissection did not impact outcome.

3. How about the prognosis of the papillary cancer in the thyroglossal duct cyst. Is there any difference in overall survival between papillary cancer in the thyroglossal duct cyst and in the thyroid gland?

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Acceptable