Reviewer's report

Title: Door handle - Handle with care. Penetrating injury with a blunt object. A case report.

Version: 3 Date: 2 September 2008

Reviewer: Amit Agrawal

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

Unusual mode of injury

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:


Author describe an interesting case of hand injury with door handle, however few points needs to be elaborated

The door on the images provided is though blunt but quite sharper at one end and in present case it looks like that this relatively sharper free end of the door
handle would had penetrated the hand of the patient. Please modify the title accordingly.

Like

Penetrating injury of the hand with door handle

Introduction

We describe an unusual penetrating injury of hand caused by a blunt object such as door handle.

Please modify accordingly

We cite an unusual injury where a door handle was found completely embedded into the hand.

We report an unusual injury where a door handle was found completely embedded into the hand.

That door handle is not that blunt where it would had made entry into the hand

Please provide the details of the local examination i.e. color of the fingers, capillary filling time and whether the Doppler study was performed

There was minimal bleeding from the wounds at the wounds.

Please change

There was minimal bleeding from the wound.

Appropriate clinical photographs may not be appropriate to include in appropriate clinical assessment

If possible please provide both AP and lateral views of the x-ray

Any follow up clinical photograph

We need to elaborate the discussion with references to include the management principles of penetrating hand injuries

Though in discussion the authors have quoted the use of tourniquet whether they used in present case is not clear

In conclusion

Blunt objects can occasionally cause penetrating injuries of hand and hence handled with care. Such injuries should be managed with meticulous early surgical exploration and care to check neurovascular integrity.

Again with the images it looks that the door handle where it entered was relatively sharp end of the handle

In particular case the patient was not handling the handle but I presume it was
accidental fall of the door on hand please modify and discuss accordingly (please make it clear in the case description whether the door fallen down on the hand or the handle fallen down on the hand)

Whether there were any associated injuries

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests