Reviewer's report

Title: Locked patellar dislocation: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 18 July 2008

Reviewer: Manjunath Koti

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Changes to be considered

Abstract:
Add 'acute' to 'patellar dislocation'
Change 'a very' to 'relatively'

Case presentation:
Change 'reattached' to 'repaired'

Introduction
Change 'a very' to 'relatively common' ,[can add - 'and most likely caused by indirect trauma (gymnastics, dancing, etc). Direct blow to the medial side occurs in
about 10% of acute dislocations).

Case presentation

Change 'origin' to 'origin'

Change 'no trauma' to 'there was no direct trauma involved'

Add 'but' before 'just'

Change 'uncommon' to 'awkward'

Delete 'revealed no important problems' to 'was unremarkable' and add 'no predisposing factors (previous trauma or significant joint laxity)'

Delete 'no previous incidents related to her knee had occurred'

CT scan also shows a loose body. If yes then point with an arrow

At one year follow up she reported no recurrence of dislocation - but was there subluxation (any radiographic evidence)

The last paragraph 'on the other hand ........dislocation' - can be deleted.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest