Reviewer's report

Title: Water intoxication presenting as maternal and neonatal seizures: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 24 June 2008

Reviewer: Lyndon Barnwell

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected association between diseases or symptoms

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is a good case of a fairly common disease due to the unusual presenting setting. The manuscript is well written and I only have two comments.

In the abstract the patient's age is reported as 38 but in the case presentation it is identified as 37. Only the patient's presenting age should be used.

In the last paragraph of the case presentation portion of the manuscript, the authors ascribe the finding of osteoporosis in this young primigravid patient to pregnancy. This report does not provide data that backs up this assertion therefore, this statement should be modified.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests