Reviewer's report

**Title:** Water intoxication presenting as maternal and neonatal seizures: a case report

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 14 April 2008

**Reviewer:** Jonathan Ball

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

**Has the case been reported coherently?:** Yes

**Is the case report authentic?:** Yes

**Is this case worth reporting?:** Yes

**Is the case report persuasive?:** Yes

**Does the case report have explanatory value?:** Yes

**Does the case report have diagnostic value?:** Yes

**Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?:** Yes

**Is the anonymity of the patient protected?:** Yes

**Comments to authors:**

Page 5, paragraph 1 (also page 2 paragraph 2)
"intubated and sedated to prevent further fitting" is a misleading and potentially hazardous clinical management plan. I assume, anti-convulsants were given with the result being a low GCS requiring intubation for airway protection. Neither intubation or routine sedation is primary management for seizures and indeed may mask the detection of further seizure activity.

Page 6, paragraph 2
How was, "no longer at risk of life threatening manifestations" determined other than serum sodium?

Page 6, paragraph 2
"12mmol/l" over what time period?

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I work with Dr Chapman and Dr Hamilton, on the same intensive care unit. I was not directly involved in the management of this patient.