Reviewer’s report

Title: Mesenteric Panniculitis with pedal edema: A case report

Version: 3 Date: 26 July 2008

Reviewer: Angel Popkharitov

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General

The aim of the authors is to present a rare clinical case of mesenteric panniculitis with pedal edema as a part of its presentation. The condition is quite rare and difficult to be suspected in preoperative phase. I commend the authors on a well structured and written case report. A thorough presentation of the clinical case is made.

Recommendations:

1. The authors should describe more profoundly and accurately the surgical finding, the type of operation. There is not clear if frozen section procedure was performed.

2. The histological findings are described insufficiently. There would be well if the authors apply an image on microscopic section, if any.

3. The authors concluded that the diagnosis of MP was made based on history, physical examination and the CT findings, but not on base of histological section.
Therefor I think the title should be changed and related with the CT examination.
4. It is not clearly described “the pedal edema” and its relation with MP.
5. A more thorough search in relevant literature would place the case report in a better context.
6. The written English needs some improvement. I suggest the authors to ask a native English speaker to check the case report for fluency.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published