Reviewer's report

Title: Occult Lung Malignancy Presenting With Finger Pain: A Case Report

Version: 3 Date: 3 July 2008

Reviewer: Robin Smith

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected association between diseases or symptoms

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Clear well written case report.
Bone metastases are common in lung cancer but this report describes an unusual site of bone metastasis and carries the message that a common disease can present in a very unusual way.
Clear radiology images which complement the text well.

Minor points:
authors state that lung cancer is commonest cancer in developed world which is no longer true as it has been overtaken by breast cancer.
It would be useful to include immunohistochemistry markers from the finger biopsy to confirm that the origin of the metastasis was from the lung.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests