Reviewer’s report

Title: A simple hepatic cyst with elevated cyst fluid CA19-9 level: a case report

Version: 4 Date: 9 July 2008

Reviewer: Shivaram Prasad Singh

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The report aims to highlight the fact that simple hepatic cyst can be associated with elevated serum and cyst fluid CA19-9. However, it is known that inflammation including cholangitis is associated with elevated serum CA19-9. In the presented case, basal CA 19-9 level was probably elevated since it was an infected hepatic cyst. This should have featured in the discussion. [Sawabu N, Takemori Y, Toya D, Yoneshima M, Kidani H, Satomura Y, Ohta H, Hattori N. Factors affecting serum levels of CA 19-9 with special reference to benign hepatobiliary and pancreatic diseases. Gastroenterol Jpn 1986;21:491-8; Ogawa T, Yokoi H, Kawarada Y. A case of inflammatory pseudotumor of the liver causing elevated serum CA19-9 levels. Am J Gastroenterol. 1998;93:2551-5.]

The report also for the first time describes changes in serum and cyst fluid CA19-9 levels after the intracystic instillation of minocycline hydrochloride. This has not been studied in other previous reports on Minocycline therapy for hepatic cysts. However it would be better if the details of the procedure of intracystic instillation of minocycline hydrochloride are mentioned.
References No. 2 & 4: Name of all authors have not been provided as per instructions.

Ref. 2: The entire list should be as follows: Yoshida H, Onda M, Tajiri T, Mamada Y, Taniai N, Mineta S, Hirakata A, Futami R, Arima Y, Inoue M, Hatta S, Kishimoto A.

Ref. 4: The entire list should be as follows: Kitajima Y, Okayama Y, Hirai M, Hayashi K, Imai H, Okamoto T, Aoki S, Akita S, Gotoh K, Ohara H, Nomura T, Joh T, Yokoyama Y, Itoh M.

Language is not up to mark. Due to inappropriate English, the meaning of sentences are distorted in some places. The manuscript needs to be rewritten.

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests