Reviewer's report

Title: A simple hepatic cyst with elevated cyst fluid CA19-9 level: a case report

Version: 4 Date: 8 July 2008

Reviewer: zahir soonawalla

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Other

If other, please specify:

Unreported effect of intervention on tumour marker levels

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The phenomenon of benign liver cysts with elevated tumour markers is well reported previously. The present report describes an additional finding - response to minocycline instillation. Though this would intuitively be expected (by causing inflammation of biliary epithelium), it is worth reporting.

It is important to highlight the frequent occurrence of elevated CA19-9, often to very high levels, with benign liver and biliary pathology, particularly if there is superadded inflammation/infection.

The report needs to be proofread thoroughly. The references should be more exhaustive, particularly the well-reported presence of elevated CA19-9 in benign liver cysts.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being
published

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests