Author's response to reviews

Title: Histologic continuity in pulmonary mucinous cystic neoplasia: in support of the adenoma-carcinoma sequence.

Authors:

Christine Wynveen (cwynveen@gmail.com)
Behnaz Behmaram (bbehmara@mcw.edu)
George Haasler (ghaasler@mcw.edu)
Nagarjun Rao (arao@mcw.edu)

Version: 7 Date: 27 May 2008

Author's response to reviews: see over
Response to reviewers’ comments

Reviewer 1:

Comment:

Overall, this is better now. The authors have improved many of the figures but the TTF-1 stain is not convincing - it should be called negative in tumor cells, which is a well-known phenomenon in primary mucinous tumors of the lung (this adds to the diagnostic problem since these tumors are also CK20 positive - this point should be added to the discussion). The title of the paper is misleading - this case report does not support the progression of adenoma to carcinoma - it should be changed to reflect the main point that mucinous carcinomas have variable appearance from well-differentiated areas to more dysplastic cells.

Authors’ response:

The TTF-1 stain result has now been called negative. The text is changed on page 6, line 19, and page 8, line 14. The figure showing TTF-1 staining (Figure 3C) has now been removed.

The discussion (page 8) has been modified slightly to indicate that the immunoprofile may be a source for diagnostic confusion. The fact that some of these tumors can be CK20 positive had already been alluded to (page 8, line 16).

The title of the paper now reads – “Diverse histologic appearances in pulmonary mucinous cystic neoplasia: a case report”.

Reviewer 2:

Comments:

Para2 page 8.....The first mention of TTF1 needs the number! No other comments to make though I would still prefer that the adenoma-carcinoma sequence reference in the title is not used.

Authors’ response:

The text on page 8 is now changed as mentioned in response to reviewer 1; TTF1 is now mentioned as such.

The title of the paper is now changed to read - “Diverse histologic appearances in pulmonary mucinous cystic neoplasia: a case report”.